CARLISLE DIOCESAN BOARD OF FINANCE LIMITED

Minutes of a meeting of the **FINANCE COMMITTEE** of the Carlisle Diocesan Board of Finance Ltd at Church House, Penrith on Wednesday, 28th November 2018.

PRESENT:

The Bishop of Carlisle
The Archdeacon of Carlisle
The Archdeacon of West Cumberland
The Archdeacon of Westmorland and Furness
Canon M Jayne (Chairman)
The Revd A Towner
Mr D W Dickinson
Mr J Edwards
Mr J E A Johnson

IN ATTENDANCE:

Mr D Hurton – Diocesan Secretary
Mr R Jaques – Head of Finance
Mr N Andrews – Property Secretary
Mrs C Barton – OpShop Development Project Officer

FC 18/126 OPENING PRAYERS

Opening prayers were led by Canon Martin Jayne.

FC 18/127 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Mrs G Troughton.

FC 18/128 MINUTES - FC 18/133

The minutes of the meeting held on 19th September 2018 were approved and signed with one minor correction.

FC 18/129 MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

i. Action Sheet - FC 18/135.

Mr Hurton reported that proposals for managing capacity in Church House were well advanced following discussions within the management team. The proposals would be discussed initially with one or two of the Trustees and then the Bishop's Leadership Team before coming back to the Committee.

ii. Outstanding Parochial Loan - FC 18/136.

Mr Jaques presented a report on the outstanding loan. The parish in question was part of a mission community which had been launched and commissioned and which was taking part in the parish offer pilot scheme. There was a query as to whether the mission community would take on this debt in the same way as they would take on assets, but there had so far been no suggestion that this would be the case.

The Committee discussed whether the situation could have been foreseen and prevented. Mr Hurton reported that there had been two cases in the last 10 years where Parishes had struggled to repay loans. There had been specific reasons in each case. In the first case the

loan had been taken out to cover legal costs following advice being obtained from a barrister. When the barrister had subsequently changed his advice, the Parish in question had already incurred substantial costs which could not then be recouped. In the current case the loan was to have been paid following the Parish reclaiming VAT on building work. The Parish had failed to adhere to the timetable for reclaiming VAT and had therefore not obtained the money. Although the Diocesan Finance Team could prompt and remind parishes about outstanding loans they could not make claims on behalf of Parishes. It was agreed that the Finance Team would request progress reports from Parishes on a more frequent basis about steps to ensure loan repayment.

iii. Further response from the Bishop to the concerns of the Finance Committee on work progress and overload of staff.

The Bishop reported on discussions and actions on this issue. He said that a number of steps were being taken which he hoped would make a difference over the coming year, not only to the staff in Church House but also more widely across the diocese. There was to be an extra residential staff meeting to discuss some of the issues. There was no easy solution as it was hard to identify work areas that we could simply stop doing.

In the discussion it was noted that there were times and areas when modest but judicious investment could reap significant benefits. The problem of overstretched staff was not just a problem in Church House but was apparent across the Diocese. The Bishop's Staff meeting would consider an analysis led by Archdeacon Pratt which had identified seventeen major issues causing concern at the moment. The pressures were not unique to the Diocese but were mirrored across many dioceses in the Church of England.

Some of the steps being taken to help included assessing and analysing the situation through a staff and clergy wellbeing survey; providing stress management workshops in Church House; developing reflective practice groups for clergy; and offering high quality occupational health support. It was noted that if additional resources were called for, the costs were not currently covered in the Diocesan budget. Bishop's Council, as the group with responsibility for advising the Finance Committee on priorities for expenditure, would need to be content to see any plans funded in future budgets.

The risk register, which was included with the papers for information at this stage, included a major risk relating to the vulnerability to staff sickness. Church House was too small for there to be much cover built into staffing arrangements.

PART A FINANCIAL POSITION AND MAJOR FINANCE MATTERS

FC 18/130 MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTS TO 31ST OCTOBER 2018 - FC 18/137

The Chairman thanked Mr Jaques for the excellent work he had done on the presentation of the management accounts over the last two years.

Mr Jaques reported that there would be a surplus on the 2018 accounts, due largely to a combination of an underspend on clergy stipends caused by the high number of vacancies, and higher investment and rental income. There were currently 14.4 vacancies out of stipendiary number of approximately 85 parochial posts. Although this saved a lot of money it represented an operational failing and created major issues on the ground. The Archdeacons were beginning to look at a recruitment and retention strategy to try to address this issue and a number of appointments had been made recently, but it continued to be hard to fill posts across most northern Dioceses.

There was a question as to when the Church Commissioner's Strategic Development Funding grant ran out and what the impact of this would be on funding for the Reach and Cumbria Christian Learning teams' work in support of God for All. Mr Hurton explained the financial strategy that had been in place since 2014 which it envisaged us growing our non-Parish Offer income and reducing other central costs, so that by the end of the current budget period any financial gap created when the grant ran out would be covered. We were on track to achieve that outcome but were struggling to achieve the budgeted figures for Parish Offer. There was no suggestion that Parish Offer would be used to cover the gap, and our expenditure on local ministry continued to be budgeted to exceed income from Offer and Parochial Fees. The growth in our non-Parish Offer income was being achieved by a combination of increases in income from the investments in hydro and from invested capital receipts.

In the discussion a number of different issues were addressed including accounting for income from the sale of properties, the process for identifying surplus properties, the difficulties in recruitment facing other organisations in Cumbria, the relative attractions of ministry in multi-parish benefices and Mission Communities as compared with that in suburban parishes with single churches, and the process for recruiting curates.

The Bishop reported that there were about eight other dioceses whose ministry strategies were similar to ours. Most of them were located on the edges of England. The only significant way in which our approach was markedly different to them was in terms of our ecumenical focus. He wanted to attract people who had a vision for God for All would who would be up for the challenge and excited by the opportunities it offered.

FC 18/131 OPSHOPS

i. Financial Statement to 31st October 2018 – FC 18/153.

The financial statement showed the cumulative loss which was carried forward from year to year and reported in the DBFs' accounts. It was noted that this year's figures included the expenses of Mrs Barton's development project role. Sales were up on last year, which was encouraging, but more needed to be done to achieve future financial sustainability.

ii. OpShops Strategic Business Plan - FC 18/139.

Mrs Barton introduced the Strategic Business Plan which showed how the transition to OpShops being a sustainable, independent social enterprise would be achieved. The key points were included in the report but the report itself could not capture or express the sense of anticipation towards establishing OpShops' own board of trustees or the positive response from the people who had been approached to serve on it. The proposed board members possessed a blend of skills and experience which they could bring to their roles.

Ultimately the plan was to recruit seven to nine trustees and five had been identified to date. It was expected that the new venture would go live in the second half of 2019. A chair of the trustees had not yet been identified and that was now a priority.

The Trustees made a number of comments and suggestions to improve the Plan. The proposed vision statement could be more aspirational. The links to the work of Revd Chris Harwood, the Pioneer Minister in Carlisle, came through strongly in the paperwork and would be a great asset for the operation as it developed. To be financially viable opshops would have to stand out from other charity shops and this would require some rebranding and strong communication of the vision so that local people wanted to buy into it, to donate

and to shop. Mrs Hodge, the Diocesan stewardship enabler could contribute to thinking about the promotion of the network and associated fund raising. There was an appetite to consider how the network could expand beyond Carlisle. The Committee concluded by emphasising the relevance of OpShops to our God for All.

The Finance Committee approved the Strategic Business Plan as a whole and agreed:

- i. that the housing costs of the house for duty Pioneer Minister who was working out part of his ministry through the OpShops should be part of the local ministry budget;
- ii. to continue to provide Church House Finance/Safeguarding/Property and HR support at negligible cost;
- iii. to provide a grant towards the new company's financial working capital or arrange a significant loan facility for the new OpShop Charitable Company;
- iv. to allow the Opshops to rent the Morton shop for a peppercorn rent;
- v. to write off the Opshops accumulated losses;
- vi. to recommend that OpShops bid for support from the Diocesan Growth Fund for the initial consumable costs of OpShop Fresh Expressions of Church.

iii. Proposal to make OpShops a Charitable Company – FC 18/138.

The Committee considered Mrs Barton's report. In looking at the proposed Trustees for the new company it was noted that so far no-one had been identified with retail expertise or experience.

Mrs Barton explained that the aim continued to be to separate OpShops out from the Diocese. A new company would be established. It would be limited by guarantee and the sole member would be the Diocesan Board of Finance but there would be no legal liabilities attached to that membership. There was some concern expressed about needing to ensure that OpShops retained their distinctive Christian ethos in the future. This could be written into the Memorandum and Articles of Association and, with the DBF as sole member, could not be changed without the DBF's consent. In addition, the DBF would have the power to appoint and remove trustees. The plan was for OpShops to become financially viable and sustainable in their own right by 2022.

There was a query about the possibility of Mrs Barton's role being extended beyond June 2019 and it was agreed that any such proposal should come back to the Finance Committee.

The Committee agreed:

- i. to establish OpShops as a Company Limited by Guarantee with the DBF as the sole member
- ii. to cover budgeted deficits of -£32,670 in 2019 and -£8,650 in 2020 with a planning assumption that OpShops would break even by 2021;
- iii. the appointment of Brabners legal practice to assist in the transition of OpShops to a charitable company;
- iv. to provide £65,000 cash reserves to the new charitable company with an additional £10,000 to provide working capital.

FC 18/132 GOD FOR ALL - FC 18/140 & FC 18/141

The Committee considered a report by Mr Hurton on resourcing the implementation of God for All. Additional funding was not being sought, but there were some implications for the DBF's employment of staff with the proposal being for the DBF to transfer-in the business and staff of Cumbria Christian Learning.

Advice would be taken from our solicitors and auditors as to the correct legal procedures to effect the transfer. There were some complications as both the DBF and CCL were charitable companies so the Charity Commission would need to be informed and might have to give permission.

The Committee agreed to the transfer of the staff and business from CCL to the Diocesan Board of Finance, with the formal transfer documentation to be approved in January.

FC 18/133 PARISH OFFER

i. Receipts to 31st October 2018 and offers for 2019 - FC 18/142.

It was reported that there were still six offers outstanding for 2019.

The Archdeacons reported on the payment of the 2018 offer by deanery, highlighting those parishes which had paid less than 75% and reporting on them on a case by case basis. It was noted that some of these parishes had been vacant for a long time and some had been using their reserves over a number of years to pay parish offer. The Archdeacons, Mr Jaques and Mrs Hodge were working together on tackling these situations.

Turning to the 2019 Offers, Mr Jaques reported that if the offers still to come in were at the same level as in 2018 then the Offer would be down by 2.6%. It was suggested that some of the reduced Offers were from parishes which were in long vacancies or where a new incumbent had just come into post after a vacancy. In other cases it appeared that parishes had simply run out of reserves. However, neither of these explanations applied in several of the presenting cases where the Offer had been reduced.

It was inevitable that there would be a time lag before any benefit was seen in terms of parish offer from the work on stewardship being done by Mrs Hodge. The Parish Offer review pilots were designed to establish ongoing relationships with mission communities and create a sense of mutual accountability around finance. However, even though the pilot process appeared to be achieving greater recognition and ownership of the issues of local finance and sustainability, it was not apparent that there would be an early impact in terms of increasing the Offer. Consideration also needed to be given to how fresh expressions were handled within the Parish Offer framework.

It was reported that Mrs Hodge had completed her research and was now drawing up a strategy and approach to supporting stewardship in the Diocese. The results of that work would come to the Committee in January and the Bishop's Council in February. One priority already identified for next year would be around fresh expressions. Another would be to consider whether the Diocese should subscribe to the national Parish Giving Scheme under which individuals' giving was index linked and paid by direct debit.

ii. Parish offer arrears - FC 18/143.

The Archdeacons reported on their engagement with those in arrears where it was felt that there was a realistic chance of obtaining further payments. It was reported that some money had been received for historic arrears and some for 2017 arrears.

Some parishes would be encouraged if we drew a line under historic resources and wrote these off, while others might respond to being reminded that they had previously not paid in full. There had been cases in the past of parishes with arrears receiving windfalls and using them to pay in full. Pursuing the remaining outstanding amounts was likely to be very time consuming as the process would have to start applying individualised approaches,

rather than blanket requests for parishes to address the issue. The easy cases had been resolved and those remaining were far less likely to result in additional payments being made.

It was agreed that decisions to write off arrears should continue to be taken on a case by case basis but with a sense that those arrears that were more than three years old were likely to be written off. The Archdeacons were thanked for their work they had done on this issue.

FC 18/134 PARISH OFFER REFUND POLICY - FC 18/141

The Committee considered the implementation of the policy to refund unbudgeted vacancy savings. Mr Hurton suggested that it would be premature and imprudent to make any decision over refunds at this point in time as we were currently in the middle of a 6 year budget period which was not turning out in line with the original plans. Given the establishment of mission communities the existing policy would in any event need to be reviewed as it was based on the structure before Mission Communities had been considered. It would be appropriate to consider the application of the policy at the end of the budget period.

The Committee agreed, with one abstention, that it would be inappropriate to consider making refunds at this point in the budget period.

PART B FINANCE - MINOR MATTERS

FC 18/135 STEWARDSHIP - FC 18/144 & FC 18/145

The Committee noted the Stewardship Activity Report and an evaluation of the Ulverston Parish Church Stewardship Campaign which had been circulated by Mrs Hodge for information. The Committee found the evaluation, which reported a significant increase in giving, to be very encouraging and to show the potential impact of effective stewardship support.

FC 18/136 RYDAL HALL

i. Draft Minutes of the meeting held on 23rd October 2018 - FC 18/146.

The Committee noted the minutes.

Archdeacon Pratt said that the budget would go to the Rydal Board in December and be presented to the Finance Committee in January. The Hall continued to face a challenging financial outlook but was aspiring to achieve financial balance by the end of 2019. This would be difficult, not least because of the impact of the minimum wage increase.

The Archdeacon commented that Rydal needed to understand how its market was changing. The market for "traditional" retreat houses had shrunk. Mrs Fogg had been appointed substantively as Manager. She was building good relationships within the team and encouraging the staff to take ownership of their particular areas of work. She was also particularly focusing on marketing the facilities at Rydal and we were starting to see the fruits of this work. The Hall was also moving from the present booking software to 'Hotel Perfect' which was a more intuitive and flexible system and would give better management information. Brexit was seen as a high risk in the Hall's Risk Register because it affected the

scope to recruit staff from Europe. There was no Chair of the Board formally in place at the current time but Archdeacon Pratt was acting as Interim.

ii. Management Accounts to 31st October 2018 - FC 18/147.

The management accounts were noted.

iii. DBF ongoing support for Rydal Hall – FC 18/148.

The Committee agreed to repeat the previous year's statement about its ongoing commitment to Rydal Hall as a subsidiary company, and passed the following resolution, as requested by the Auditors:

"The Carlisle Diocesan Board of Finance remains committed to the work and ministry of Rydal Hall Ltd. The DBF will continue to keep the ongoing operation and viability of Rydal Hall Ltd under close review in the course of 2019 and 2020 and will continue to give both practical and financial support, if required, to enable it to continue with its work in the Diocese."

FC 18/137 CUMBRIA CHRISTIAN LEARNING

i. Minutes of the meeting held on 18th September 2018 – FC 18/149.

The minutes were noted.

In the discussion there was a query about the approach used in the Diocese to assess the impact of CCL on our mission and ministry in the Diocese/county. It was important that we had a way to measure this. Mr Hurton explained how he understood the governance of the Diocese to work in that respect. The review and assessment of operational and missional performance of the Boards and Committees of the Diocese should be undertaken through the Synodical government route. This gave key roles to the Bishop's Council and Diocesan Synod. The DBF's role was to provide the financial resources required to implement the priorities identified by Bishop's Council and to ensure that they were managed effectively. As CCL would be subsumed within the DBF in the early part of 2019 the Finance Committee would then be able to scrutinise its financial performance as part of the regular process of reviewing the management accounts. If the Finance Committee felt that there was a lack of accountability for operational performance then it could consider raising that issue with the Bishop's Council. There was a deliberate overlap between membership of the Finance Committee and the Council which should enable such an issue to be raised effectively.

ii. Management Accounts to 31st October 2018 - FC 18/150.

The accounts, showing a surplus for the period, were noted.

FC 18/138 MULTI-ACADEMY TRUST

i. Draft Minutes of the meeting held on 30th September 2018 – FC 18/151.

The minutes were noted. It was reported that the performance at Ambleside School was very encouraging.

ii. Draft Accounts to 31st August 2018 – FC 18/152.

The current financial position of the MAT was noted. Work was being done to complete the statutory accounts for the year ended 31st August 2018.

iii. The appointment of a DBF Member to the MAT to replace Mr Michael Bonner.

Archdeacon Pratt agreed to take on this role until it could be reviewed in January 2019.

FC 18/139 DEAN EDUCATIONAL FOUNDATION

The Committee noted that in 2001 a covenant had been lifted to enable the building of a multi-purpose hall for Dean School. The Committee agreed that a restriction preventing the sale of alcohol should be lifted to enable those managing the school to establish their own rules appropriate to the present time.

FC 18/140 DATES FOR 2020

The following dates for meetings of the Committee in 2020 were noted.

Wednesday, 22nd January Wednesday, 18th March Wednesday, 20th May Wednesday, 15th July Wednesday, 16th September Wednesday, 18th November

PART C PROPERTY MATTERS

FC 18/141 PROPERTY ISSUES REQUIRING FINANCE COMMITTEE ATTENTION - FC 18/154

i. Property Sub-Committee Minutes and Meetings.

The Committee received the minutes of the Property Sub-Committee held on 12th October 2018.

- ii. Significant Update items to note since the Property Sub-Committee meeting.
- (a) Broughton in Furness and Kirkby Ireleth. No appointment had been made and arrangements were being made to market both houses for rent.
- **(b) Beetham.** The post was no longer being advertised and arrangements were being made to market the house for rent.
- (c) Grasmere Rectory (& Tithe Barn). Progress on the sale had been delayed by the need for the diocese to secure planning permission for the replacement water treatment plant. An agent had been instructed to make the application.
- (d) Brough with Stainmore. Marketing had produced significant interest and final offers had been invited. The highest offer had been accepted and solicitors had been instructed.
- **(e) Eskdale (Boot) Vicarage.** The tenants had found alternative housing and the house was to be taken back on 4th December. Arrangements would be made in the New Year to market the house and surrounding glebe. Agent's advice and a guide price were to be reviewed by the Property Sub-Committee.

iii. Significant Update items to note since the Property Sub-Committee meeting

(a) West Walls Old Vicarage. Mr Andrews reported that the property would not suit the Community of the Holy Name and that the Community had therefore withdrawn their

interest. The property had been marketed and an offer had been accepted. The sale was in the hands of solicitors and hopefully would be completed before Christmas.

(b) Church House, Carlisle. Separation works were completed and contracts drafted. This was now in the hands of the solicitors.

Closed Churches

- **i. Warwick on Eden St Leonard.** One representation against residential disposal had been received by the Church Commissioners. A response had been sent on behalf of Bishop James following which the representation had been withdrawn. The Commissioners would now proceed to make the disposal scheme.
- **ii.** Barrow St Matthew. The Commissioners had published the draft disposal scheme approving a lease to the community Halls Association. The consultation period had not yet ended.
- **iii. Lindale St Paul.** At the request of the new Team Rector the closure of the church had been put on hold to allow alternative options for the future of the church to be explored.

Glebe

i. Addingham Glebe – Land at Little Salkeld. The sale of part of the glebe for development was progressing. A letter had been received from the Parochial Church Council asking the Board to make a contribution towards the cost of church repairs.

The Committee noted that the proceeds of glebe sales were restricted for the Diocesan Stipends Fund and any grant would need to be funded from other DBF funds. The Committee agreed to a grant equivalent to 5% of the sale proceeds with a caveat that confirmation was received that full funding was available for the work on the Church. Mr Hurton was to check whether there was an chancel repair liability attached to the Church.

- ii. Unit 2, 19-24 Friargate, Penrith. Mr Andrews reported that the prospective tenant now did not think they could take on the lease at the discounted price. It could be offered to them at a lower rent or the Committee could consider the possibility of retaining the unit for diocesan use and allowing the prospective tenant to pay to use it on a number of occasions in a year. The Committee agreed not pursue letting the unit, pending an appraisal of the options and costs for in-house use.
- **iii. Gosforth Glebe.** The Committee agreed to allow a nine month extension to the long stop contract date which had now expired.
- **iv. 30 Market Place, Richmond.** It was reported that a further £4,000 had been received, bringing total payments of arrears to £33,500. This represented a very successful outcome and the former tenants had been advised that the matter was now closed.
- v. Caldbeck Grazing Rights. The sale of the grazing rights had been completed on 22nd November 2018.
- vi. Carlisle Stanwix, Boys Brigade Hut. The hut had suffered serious fire damage. Contact had been made with the current occupier and further discussions would be held on its future.

v. Wigton Former Glebe. Confirmation was awaited of the completion of the sale of the mineral rights.

Closed Schools

- i. Wham Head Farm. An offer from the tenant for the freehold of the farm and the separate telecommunications mast had been accepted. The sale was in the hands of solicitors and completion was expected in January.
- **ii. Allithwaite Institute.** The draft Education Order which would allow disposal of the sale proceeds had now been published.
- iii. Great Strickland Playground. The new lease had been completed.

PART D PARISH PROPERTY FUND

FC 18/142 REQUESTS FROM PARISHES FOR FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE

- i. Kirkby Thore Parochial Church Council: St Michael's Church. The Committee noted a grant of £3,000 towards the provision of a church toilet and kitchen.
- ii. Kirkandrews on Eden Parochial Church Council: Beaumont St Mary. The Committee noted a grant of up to £3,000 towards a feasibility study to adapt the building for greater general community use.

PART E TRUST MATTERS

PART F FINANCIAL STATEMENTS AND REPORTS

FC 18/143 TREASURY AND INVESTMENTS - FC 18/155

Mr Jaques reported that the value of the investments had fallen as share prices reduced but that this might be beneficial as we anticipated purchasing further shares in the coming months. A lower share price would enable us to buy more shares.

In response to a query it was reported that the Rydal Hydro loan represented money we had borrowed from the Central Board of Finance and that this was being paid back at £100,000 a year. It was noted that with the current interest rate being charged we would continue to be better off investing any proceeds from the sale of property, rather than paying off the loan.

FC 18/144 PASTORAL ACCOUNT STATEMENT TO 31ST OCTOBER 2018 – FC 18/156

The Committee noted the statement.

FC 18/145 GLEBE STATEMENT TO 31ST OCTOBER 2018 - FC 18/157

The Committee noted the statement.

FC 18/146 BARCHESTER STATEMENT TO 31ST OCTOBER 2018 – FC 18/158

The statement was noted. Attention was drawn to the school maintenance accounts and it was reported that a number of schools had now made payment commitments for the outstanding balances. It was agreed that the provision in the accounts against outstanding balances at 31st December 2018 should be increased by an additional £21,000.

FC 18/147 PARISH PROPERTY FUND TO 31ST OCTOBER 2018 - FC 18/159

The Committee noted the statement.

FC 18/148 GROWTH FUND STATEMENT TO 31ST OCTOBER 2018 - FC 18/160

The Committee noted the statement. Mr Hurton explained that grants for projects were usually made over three years and gave an example of a parish wanting to employ a children's worker, in which case a grant would usually reduce over three years. Typically a grant for such a purpose would be £5,000 in year one, £4,000 in year two and £3,000 in year three, making £12,000 in all.

FC 18/149 LOAN STATEMENT TO 31ST OCTOBER 2018 - FC 18/161

The Committee noted the statement.

FC 18/150 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Following a discussion about changing the date to 16th January, it was agreed that the meeting would be held on Wednesday, 23rd January 2019.

At the end of the meeting Canon Jayne, who was retiring as Chair and as a member of the Committee, said that in his opinion the Finance Committee was one of the most interesting in the Diocese and that he felt confident about its future. He had worked with a number of staff over the years and had seen a fair number of changes, especially the office moving from Carlisle to Penrith. He expressed his gratitude to the staff for their work over the twelve years he had been associated with the Committee.

Mr Dickinson who was also retiring had served on the Committee for eight a half years said that he had enjoyed his time serving on the Committee. He had learned a lot and hoped he had contributed to the work of the Committee.

The Bishop thanked both Canon Jayne and Mr Dickson for their service to the Diocese over the years and particularly to Canon Jayne for his time as Chair of the Committee.